



December 14, 2015

Mr. Franklin Christman
Village Administrator
Village of Ashville
200 East Station Street
Ashville, Ohio 43103

**RE: Bid Recommendations
Village of Ashville, Ohio WRRF Improvements 2015 (Part A)
60440011**

Dear Mr. Christman:

Bids were received for the above-referenced project and publicly opened on Friday December 11, 2015, at 2:00 PM. A total of four bids were received; each from General Contractors offering a lump sum price, and cost of required Alternates. Listed below is information on these bids:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Base Bid Amount</u>
Peterson Construction Company	\$11,580,000
Danis Industrial Construction Company	\$12,287,000
Kirk Brothers Construction, Inc.	\$12,397,000
Adams Robinson Enterprises, Inc.	\$15,000,000

The Engineer's estimate of cost of construction was \$11,716,000. The low bid did not exceed 10% of the Engineer's Estimate. The bids ranged from 1.2% below to 28% above the estimate.

Note that there were required Alternates submitted as part of the bids. The complete tabulation of the Base Bid and Alternate amounts are shown on the attached spreadsheet. The combination of any accepted Alternate with the base bid will not change the order of the bidders, low to high.

The three lowest bids were reviewed for conformance with the bidding requirements of the Contract Documents and comments are listed below:

Bid Form, Section 00 4113

- Each bidder submitted a completed bid form as required.

Acknowledgement of Addendum, Section 00 4113, Page 2

- Each bidder acknowledged receipt of Addenda 1, 2, 3, and 4.



Bid Price Extensions, Section 00 4113, Page 4

- Each bidder's written numeric bid number matched their bid written in words.

Bid Security, Section 00 4313

- Each bidder submitted fully executed bonds on forms meeting the requirements of the Ohio Revised Code.
 - Peterson Construction Company: The bidder listed Ohio Farmers Insurance as their bonding company.
 - Danis Industrial Construction Company: The bidder listed Travelers Casualty and Surety Company of America as their bonding company.
 - Kirk Bros. Co., Inc.: The bidder listed Ohio Farmers Insurance as their bonding company.
- Each bidder's bonding company is listed in the Department of the Treasury Circular 570 as required.

Substitution Request Form, Section 00 4325

- None of the bidders listed any requested substitutions.

Proposed Products Form, Section 00 4333

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Proposed Products Form as required.

Proposed Subcontractors Form, Section 00 4336

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Proposed Subcontractors Form as required.

Bidder's Qualifications, Section 00 4513

- Each bidder has submitted qualifications and references that imply and represent that they are responsible and viable organizations which are capable of completing the work. We have previously checked references, and completed projects will all these contractors, and have no reason to believe that they not qualified to successfully complete this project.

OEPA WPCLF Program Requirements, Section 00 4515

- EEO Certification: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.
- Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.
- DBE Forms 1A and 1B (note that these forms can be submitted after the bid):
 - Peterson Construction: Neither Forms 1A or 1B were signed or completed.

- Danis Industrial Construction Company: Form 1A was not signed. Form 1B was signed, and noted that the information would be forthcoming
 - Kirk Bros. Co., Inc.; Form 1A was not signed, and no information was filled in. Form 1B was signed but no information was listed
- American Iron & Steel Sign-off Form: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.

Non-Collusion Affidavit, Section 00 4519

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Non-Collision Affidavit Form as required.

Personal Property Tax Disclosure Affidavit, Section 00 4529

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Personal Property Tax Disclosure Affidavit Form as required.

Comments on Variances

The Instruction to Bidders gives the Owner the right to waive any apparent irregularities in the bids. Our understanding is that this relates to conditions that would materially affect the price of the bid or give the bidder a critical advantage.

In the case of the three bids reviewed for this project, no variances were noted. In our opinion, there were no significant variances in the three bids reviewed giving one bidder an unfair advantage over the other.

Recommendation

It is the professional engineering opinion of AECOM that each of the three lowest bidders have sufficiently complied with the Project Manual requirements. As noted, the Owner has the right to waive discrepancies as described in the Instructions to Bidders. There does not appear to be significant procedural, technical, or administrative restrictions in awarding the subject Contract.

Based on the pricing of the required Alternates, we do not recommend that Owner accept either Alternate 1 and Alternate 2, and that the Contract be awarded based on the Base Bid equipment and pricing.



Subject to review of your legal counsel and a determination that the Village has the funds available to cover the cost of the proposed work, we recommend that the Contract be awarded to:

Peterson Construction Co.
18817 SR 501 N.
Wapakoneta, Ohio 45895
In the amount of \$11,580,000

AECOM recommends that the Village have the bids reviewed by the appropriate legal counsel prior to the final Contract award to ensure that the legal and bonding requirements of the Bidding Documents are satisfied.

Sincerely,

AECOM Corporation

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matt Noelker". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Matthew Noelker, P.E.

Enclosures: Bid Tabulation

cc: Central Files
Jeff Kerr, P.E. – AECOM
Brian Benedict – AECOM